

RFP #09-34 Student Accident & Athletic Insurance	TX Monarch	The Baker Agency, Inc. for the Brokerage Store	Bene-Marc, Inc.	ALAMO Insurance Group, Inc.
Contact Information:	Kent Holbert P.O. Box 581 Commerce, TX 75249 PH: 903-886-6943 Fax: 903-886-6947 kholbert@kovote.com	Phil Baker P.O. Box 390 Plainwell, MI 49080 PH: 800-223-1318 Fax: 269-685-8810 info@bakerathletic.com	Ralph Dintino 6301 Southwest Blvd., Suite 101 Ft. Worth, TX 76132 PH: 817-738-6899 Fax: 817-738-1811	Pat McMahan 3201 Cherry Ridge Dr., Ste. D405 San Antonio, TX 78230 PH: 210-930-6665 Fax: 210-930-1838
Notified of RFP	Friday, May 22, 2009 by e-mail	Friday, May 22, 2009 by e-mail	Monday, May 25, 2009 by voice message (by e-mail Tuesday, May 26, 2009)	Responded from public notice or thru other e-mail contact(s) done on May 22 or 25, 2009
Required Forms Signed and Returned and other requirements submitted according to RFP	Completed in Full	Some forms completed but missing other requested information	Mostly Completed	Completed in Full
Quality of Proposal Response	Above Adequate in providing information	Lacking	Adequate	Adequate
Quality of Enrollment Materials/Process/Bi-Lingual?	Online/Brochure/Bi-Lingual Provided	Online/Brochure/no indication of Bi-Lingual	Didn't provide	Brochure/Bi-Lingual
References/Like size School Districts	Provided	Not Provided	Provided	Provided
Compliance with HIPAA and FERPA	Statement Provided	Didn't provide statement	Didn't provide statement	Didn't provide statement
Resumes and quality of experience	Meets expectations of IISD	Not Provided - only years of operation	Not Provided - only years of operation	Meets expectations of IISD
Voluntary Coverage Carrier and AM Best Rating	United HealthCare Insurance Company - "A" rating with a future outlook Stable	Columbian Life Ins. Company - "A" rating with a future outlook Stable	Fidelity Security Life Ins. Company - "A-" rating with a future outlook Stable	Markel Insurance Company - "A" rating with a future outlook Stable
Cost of At-School Voluntary Plan*	\$54 or \$79	\$75.00	\$65.00	\$20 or \$37 or \$64
Cost of 24-Hour Voluntary Plan*	\$107 or \$164	\$160.00	\$130.00	\$90 or \$155 or \$229
Full Coverage - No Balance Network Available - Name of it	YES - True Choice	YES - USA/MCO	YES - Texas First Kids	NO
Voluntary Extended Dental Premium*	\$8.00	\$8.00	included	included
Voluntary Varsity Football Premium*	\$158 or \$243 grades 9-12	\$225 grades 10-12	\$299 grades 9-12	\$145 or \$225 or \$299 grades 9-12
Spring Football*	\$97 or \$63 as a separate program from Varsity	included in Football premium	did not provide separate premium or state included in Football Premium	\$51 or \$68 or \$105

RFP #09-34 Student Accident & Athletic Insurance		TX Monarch	The Baker Agency, Inc. for the Brokerage Store	Bene-Marc, Inc.	ALAMO Insurance Group, Inc.
*Voluntary Premiums are set for the 09-10 SY, but are subject to change in subsequent years					
Catastrophic Carrier and AM Best Rating	Mutual of Omaha - A+ rating with future outlook Stable	National Union Fire Insurance Company - A rating with future outlook Negative	National Union Fire Insurance Company - A rating with future outlook Negative	National Union Fire Insurance Company - A rating with future outlook Negative	National Union Fire Insurance Company - A rating with future outlook Negative
Catastrophic Premium Year 1***	\$10,827.49 for \$5,000,000 with a Cash option of \$500,000 paid out over 10 years - grades 7-12	\$8,842.00 for \$6,000,000 with a Cash option of \$500,000 paid out over 10 years - grades 7-12	\$8,842.00 for \$6,000,000 with a Cash option of \$500,000 paid out over 10 years	\$7,883.00 for \$6,000,000 with a Cash option of \$500,000 paid out over 10 years	\$10,374.00 for \$6,000,000 with a Cash option of \$500,000 paid out over 10 years
***Premiums can actually be higher or lower than at the point in time the proposal was submitted and with yearly changes up or					
Catastrophic Premium Year 2 (based on 10% Cap exclusive of Medical Inflation)	\$10,827.49 or up to \$11,910.24	\$8,842 or up to \$9,726.20	did not provide	did not provide	did not provide
Catastrophic Premium Year 3 (based on 10% Cap exclusive of Medical Inflation)	\$10,827.49 or up to \$13,101.26	\$9,726.20 or up to \$10,698.82	did not provide	did not provide	did not provide
Catastrophic Premium Year 4 (based on 10% Cap exclusive of Medical Inflation)	\$10,827.49 or up to \$14,411.39	\$10,698.82 or up to \$11,768.70	did not provide	did not provide	did not provide
Catastrophic Premium Year 5 (based on 10% Cap exclusive of Medical Inflation)	\$10,827.49 or up to \$15,852.53	\$11,768.70 or up to \$12,945.57	did not provide	did not provide	did not provide
Additional Comments	Football and Voluntary Plans have a Premier or Economy Price/Benefit Option. Catastrophic includes benefit for loss of life due to heart or circulatory malfunction.	Football and Voluntary Plans have a Premier or Economy Price/Benefit Option.	No pricing provided beyond 09-10 school year for voluntary or catastrophic coverage.	No pricing provided beyond 09-10 school year for voluntary or catastrophic coverage.	No pricing provided beyond 09-10 school year for voluntary or catastrophic coverage but provided a multi-year agreement wording indicating possible yearly "reasonable" rate increases. Football and Voluntary Plans have a Deluxe, Basic, or Economy Price/Benefit Option.

RFP #09-34 Student Accident & Athletic Insurance	TX Monarch	The Baker Agency, Inc. for the Brokerage Store	Bene-Marc, Inc.	ALAMO Insurance Group, Inc.	
Evaluation Criteria	AWARDED				
Proposed Fee Schedule - 20%	0.4	0.8	0.8	1	0.6
Reputation - 10%	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5
Quality - 15%	0.75	0.75	0.15	0.45	0.75
Extent that meets Needs - 24%	1.2	0.96	0.72	0.72	0.72
Past relationship with IISD - 15%	0.75	0.6	0.45	0.45	0.45
Underutilized Businesses - 1%	0.05	0.05	0.05	0.05	0.05
Long Term Cost to IISD - 5%	0.2	0.2	0.15	0.15	0.15
Other Relevant Factors - 10%	0.5	0.4	0	0.3	0.4
Total of Points - (scale of 1 to 5 was used with 2 being neutral--with weight specified in percentages)	4.35	4.26	2.82	3.62	3.62